

# EFFECT OF CU<sup>2+</sup> CONCENTRATION ON GROWTH, ANTIOXIDANT ENZYME ACTIVITY AND MALONDIALDEHYDE CONTENT IN GARLIC (ALLIUM SATIVUM L.)

QINGMIN MENG<sup>1</sup>, JING ZOU<sup>1</sup>, JINHUA ZOU<sup>1</sup>, WUSHENG JIANG<sup>2</sup>, AND DONGHUA LIU<sup>1\*</sup>

 <sup>1</sup>Department of Biology, College of Chemistry and Life Sciences, Tianjin Normal University, Tianjin 300387, P.R. China
<sup>2</sup>Library, Tianjin Normal University, Tianjin 300387, P.R. China

Received February 15, 2007; revision accepted June 30, 2007

The effects of different concentrations  $(10^{-5} \text{ M}, 10^{-4} \text{ M}, 10^{-3} \text{ M})$  of  $\text{Cu}^{2+}$  on growth, antioxidant enzyme activity and malondialdehyde (MDA) content were investigated in hydroponically grown *Allium sativum* L. The results indicated that the growth of garlic seedlings was not inhibited under treatment with  $10^{-5} \text{ M Cu}^{2+}$ . Garlic seedlings exposed to  $10^{-4} \text{ M}$  and  $10^{-3} \text{ M Cu}^{2+}$  exhibited significant growth reduction. With increasing  $\text{Cu}^{2+}$  concentration and treatment time, superoxide dismutase (SOD) activity increased in leaves and roots, and peroxidase (POD) activity increased in leaves. In roots of plants exposed to  $10^{-4} \text{ M}$  and  $10^{-3} \text{ M Cu}^{2+}$ , POD activity increased within 9 d and then dropped, but was still higher than in the control at the end of the experiment. Catalase (CAT) activity increased in seedlings grown at  $10^{-5} \text{ M}$  and  $10^{-4} \text{ M}$ , whereas a highly toxic level of  $\text{Cu}^{2+}$  ( $10^{-3} \text{ M}$ ) markedly inhibited CAT activity. SOD and POD activity were higher in roots than in leaves, whereas CAT activity was higher in leaves than in roots under both control and  $\text{Cu}^{2+}$  treatments. There was no obvious effect on MDA content in the seedlings treated with  $10^{-5} \text{ M Cu}^{2+}$ ; at  $10^{-4} \text{ M}$  and  $10^{-3} \text{ M Cu}^{2+}$  it increased. The mechanisms of  $\text{Cu}^{2+}$ toxicity and  $\text{Cu}^{2+}$  tolerance in garlic are briefly discussed.

Key words: Allium sativum L., copper, antioxidant enzymes, malondialdehyde.

### INTRODUCTION

Copper is considered an essential microelement for plants. It is required by biological systems as a structural and catalytic component of proteins and enzymes such as Cu and Zn superoxide dismutases (SOD) and ascorbate peroxidases (Ouzounidou, 1994), and it is involved in electron transport in photosynthesis (Lombardi and Sebastiani, 2004; Yang et al., 2004). When absorbed in excess, however, copper can be considered a toxic element, leading to physiological constraints that decrease the vigor of plants and inhibit plant growth (Ouzounidou et al., 1992; Ouzounidou, 1994). It may induce alterations in photosynthetic and respiratory processes, enzyme activity, and membrane integrity (Ouzounidou et al., 1992; Wang et al., 2000; Wisniewski and Dickinson, 2003; Alaoui-Sossé et al., 2004).

It is known that excess heavy metals in cells cause molecular damage to plants either directly or indirectly through the formation of reactive oxygen

PL ISSN 0001-5296

species (ROS) such as hydrogen peroxide (H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>), hydroxyl radical ( $\cdot$ OH) and superoxide radicals ( $O_2 \cdot \overline{}$ ) (Scandalios et al., 1997; Noctor and Foyer, 1998; Lin and Kao, 2000). An important feature of copper toxicity is the generation of active oxygen species that cause oxidative stress to plants. Evidence that copper causes the production of ROS in plants came from research on Prunus cerasifera and Arabidopsis thaliana (Lombardi and Sebastiani, 2004). Harmful ROS can damage biological molecules such as lipids, which are altered by peroxidation (Halliwell and Gutteridge, 1984; Aust and Morehouse, 1985; Weckx and Clijsters, 1996). Measurement of malondialdehyde (MDA) levels is routinely used as an index of lipid peroxidation under stress conditions (Shah et al., 2001; Zhang et al., 2005).

In plants there are protective enzymatic mechanisms and non-enzymatic mechanisms to scavenge ROS and alleviate their deleterious effects. The antioxidant enzymes include superoxide dismutase (SOD, E.C. 1.15.1.1), peroxidases (POD, E.C. 1.11.1.7), and catalase (CAT, E.C. 1.11.1.6)

<sup>\*</sup>e-mail: donghua@mail.zlnet.com.cn

(Scandalios, 1993; Scandalios et al., 1997). The importance of antioxidant enzymes in preventing oxidative stress by scavenging ROS is generally emphasized (Dawes, 2000). SOD dismutates  $O_2^-$  to  $H_2O_2$ , and this is decomposed to  $H_2O$  by POD and CAT, so that the accumulation of  $O_2^-$  and  $H_2O_2$  is effectively prevented (Panla and Thompson, 1984; Scandalios, 1993; Yan et al., 1997; Liu et al., 2002). The excess active oxygen species and peroxide can be cleared and lipid peroxidation prevented by those enzymes working together (van Assche and Clijsters, 1990).

Garlic (Allium sativum L.) was reported to be capable of tolerating heavy metal stress (Zhao and Bi, 1999). Little is known about the effects of  $Cu^{2+}$  on the physiological processes of garlic seedlings such as the antioxidant system or lipid peroxidation. The aim of this investigation was to clarify the effects of different concentrations of  $Cu^{2+}$  on the growth of garlic, the activity of antioxidant enzymes (SOD, POD and CAT), and MDA content in garlic plants. The possible mechanisms of garlic seedlings' tolerance of  $Cu^{2+}$  stress are discussed in the present study.

### MATERIALS AND METHODS

### PLANT CULTIVATION, TREATMENT AND GROWTH ANALYSIS

Equal-sized and healthy bulbs of Allium sativum L. cloves were chosen. The bulbs had not started to form green leaves or to grow roots. Before starting the experiment, the dry scales of the bulbs were removed. The bulbs were germinated and grown in tap water for five days. Then 20 seedlings were chosen and divided into four groups. Three Cu<sup>2+</sup> treatment groups were transplanted to three containers (10 cm tall, 20 cm  $\times$  20 cm) for 12 days with 2 L Hoagland's nutrient solution (Stephan and Prochazka, 1989) spiked with different  $Cu^{2+}$  concentrations:  $10^{-5}$  M,  $10^{-4}$  M and  $10^{-3}$  M. These doses were chosen in view of findings on Cu toxicity in Allium cepa (Liu et al., 1995) and Allium sativum (Liu and Kottke, 2004) in the range from  $10^{-5}$  M to  $10^{-3}$  M. Cu<sup>2+</sup> was provided as copper sulfate (CuSO<sub>4</sub>  $\cdot$  5H<sub>2</sub>O). The solutions (pH 5.5) were prepared in deionized water. Hoagland's nutrient solution was used for the control. The solutions were continuously aerated with an air pump and changed every four days.

The color, number and length of leaves and roots were observed, measured and recorded every three days.

#### ENZYME ACTIVITY

The second leaf and  $\sim 200$  mg roots from fresh seedlings were harvested every three days, weighed, washed with distilled water and then homogenized

with a mortar and pestle with 5 mL chilled sodium phosphate buffer (50 mM, pH 7.8). The homogenates were centrifuged at 10,000 g for 20 min at 4°C. The supernatant was stored at 4°C and used for SOD, POD and CAT assays.

The activity of SOD was measured according to the modified method of Zhang et al. (2005) in terms of its ability to inhibit photochemical reduction of nitroblue tetrazolium (NBT) at 560 nm. The reaction mixture consisted of 54 mL methionine, 2 mL nitroblue tetrazolium chloride (NBT), 2 mL EDTA-Na<sub>2</sub> and 2 mL riboflavin. An appropriate quantity of enzyme extract was added to the reaction mixture. One unit of SOD was defined as the enzyme amount causing 50% inhibition of NBT reduction. SOD activity is expressed as units per mg fresh weight of seedlings.

The activity of POD was determined as described by Zhang et al. (2005). The reaction mixture in a total volume of 50 mL 100 mM sodium phosphate buffer (pH 6.0) containing 28  $\mu$ L guaiacol (100%) and 9  $\mu$ L H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> (30%) was prepared immediately before use. Then 1 mL enzyme extract was added to 3 mL reaction mixture. When enzyme extract was added to the reaction mixture, the reaction time was recorded immediately. The increase in absorbance was measured at 470 nm at 30 sec intervals up to 2 min using a UV-Vis spectrophotometer (UV-2550, Shimadzu, Japan). The results are presented as  $\Delta$ OD<sub>470nm</sub> per min per g fresh weight.

The activity of CAT was measured following Beers and Sizer (1952). The reaction mixture contained 1.5 mL 200 mM sodium phosphate buffer (pH 7.8), 1.0 mL deionized water and 0.3 mL of 0.1 M  $H_2O_2$ prepared immediately before use, after which 0.2 mL enzyme extract was added. The reduction in absorbance was measured at 240 nm at 30 sec intervals up to 2 min using a UV-Vis spectrophotometer (UV-2550, Shimadzu, Japan). Activity was expressed as  $\Delta OD_{240nm}$  per min per g fresh weight.

### ESTIMATION OF LIPID PEROXIDES

The level of lipid peroxidation products was expressed as malondialdehyde (MDA) according to Buege and Aust (1978). The second leaf and ~200 mg roots from seedlings of each treatment were harvested every three days and weighed, cleaned with distilled water and then extracted in 5 ml 10% trichloroacetic acid (TCA) using a chilled mortar and pestle. The extracts were centrifuged at 4000 g for 10 min. 2 mL of 0.6% 2-thiobarbituric acid (TBA) in 10% TCA was added to the supernatant. The obtained mixture was heated in boiled water for 15 min and then quickly cooled in an ice bath. After centrifugation at 10,000 g (Eppendorf 5210R) for 10 min, the absorbance of supernatant was recorded at



**Fig. 1.** Effects of different concentrations of  $Cu^{2+}$  on growth of *Allium sativum* during 3–12 days. (a) Leaves, (b) Roots (Vertical bars denote SE). Values with different letters differ significantly from each other (p < 0.05, t-test).

532 nm and 450 nm. The blank was 2 mL 0.6% TBA in 10% TCA without the extracts. The MDA concentrations are expressed as n mol  $g^{-1}$  fresh weight.

#### STATISTICAL ANALYSIS

Each treatment was triplicated for statistical validity. Data from this investigation were analyzed with standard statistical software (Sigma Plot 9.0) using means  $\pm$  standard error (SE). For equality of averages the t-test was applied. Results were considered statistically significant at p < 0.05.

### RESULTS

# EFFECTS OF Cu<sup>2+</sup> ON SEEDLING GROWTH

The effects of  $Cu^{2+}$  on leaves depended on the concentration used. Control seedlings usually had 4 or 5 green leaves when harvested. The seedlings treated with  $10^{-5}$  M and  $10^{-4}$  M  $Cu^{2+}$  were more or less the same as the control. Compared to the control, the seedlings grown under  $10^{-3}$  M  $Cu^{2+}$  were obviously inhibited in leaf growth and had only 2 or 3 leaves.

The roots of control seedlings were in good condition, but toxic effects were observed in roots of seedlings exposed to  $Cu^{2+}$  stress at  $10^{-4}$  M and  $10^{-3}$  $Cu^{2+}$ . The roots had fewer branches, and the root tips were blue and slightly decomposed. Figure 1 shows that leaf and root growth was progressively inhibited with increasing  $Cu^{2+}$  concentration, and that the effect was more significant under treatment with  $10^{-4}$  M and  $10^{-3}$  M  $Cu^{2+}$ . The growth of seedlings exposed to  $10^{-3}$  M  $Cu^{2+}$  solution stopped; seedlings grown with  $10^{-5}$  M Cu<sup>2+</sup> were not significantly inhibited.

## EFFECT OF Cu<sup>2+</sup> ON SOD ACTIVITY

Figure 2a shows that the activity of SOD in leaves of control seedlings increased during the first 3 days of growth and then remained stable. It increased slightly in leaves subjected to  $10^{-4}$  M Cu<sup>2+</sup> versus controls only during the first 3 days of stress. However, seedlings exposed to  $10^{-3}$  M Cu<sup>2+</sup> showed an obvious increase in SOD activity: it rose 86.7% in leaves after 12 days of the applied stress.

In roots of control seedlings there was no change in SOD activity during 12 days of growth (Fig. 2b). SOD activity increased rapidly under treatment with  $10^{-4}$  M and  $10^{-3}$  M Cu<sup>2+</sup>; it increased 565.4% in roots exposed to  $10^{-3}$  M Cu<sup>2+</sup> after 12 days. Roots showed higher SOD activity than leaves.

### EFFECT OF Cu<sup>2+</sup> ON POD ACTIVITY

Increasing levels of  $Cu^{2+}$  led to a concomitant increase in POD activity in leaves (Fig. 2c). POD activity in leaves of seedlings exposed to  $10^{-4}$  M Cu<sup>2+</sup> was higher than in the control only after 3 and 6 days of the applied stress. Plants exposed to  $10^{-3}$  M Cu<sup>2+</sup> showed an obvious increase in POD activity versus the control and other Cu<sup>2+</sup> treatments.

POD activity in both the control and stressed seedling roots increased during the early days of growth, reaching maximum at day 9 and then dropping (Fig. 2d). After 12 days, the roots of seedlings growing under exposure to a moderate level of  $10^{-4}$  M Cu<sup>2+</sup> showed higher POD activity than in the other treatments and the control; such a result was



**Fig. 2.** Effects of different concentrations of  $Cu^{2+}$  on the activities of three antioxidant enzymes in *Allium sativum* exposed to  $Cu^{2+}$  stress over 12 days. (a) SOD in leaves, (b) SOD in roots, (c) POD in leaves, (d) POD in roots, (e) CAT in leaves, (f) CAT in roots. Vertical bars denote SE. Values with different letters differ significantly from each other (p < 0.05, t-test).



**Fig. 3.** Effects of different concentrations of  $Cu^{2+}$  on MDA content in *Allium sativum* exposed to  $Cu^{2+}$  stress over 12 days. (a) Leaves, (b) Roots. Vertical bars denote SE. Values with different letters differ significantly from each other (p < 0.05, t-test).

not found for the  $10^{-3}$  M treatment. In 12-day seedlings, POD activity under  $10^{-3}$  M,  $10^{-4}$  M and  $10^{-5}$  M Cu<sup>2+</sup> stress were obviously higher than in the control plants. Both the controls and Cu<sup>2+</sup> treatments showed higher POD activity in shoots than in roots.

#### EFFECT OF Cu<sup>2+</sup> ON CAT ACTIVITY

Figure 2e,f shows increased CAT activity in both leaves and roots concomitantly with increased  $Cu^{2+}$  level, except at the  $10^{-3}$  M dose. Roots growing in the  $10^{-5}$  M and  $10^{-4}$  M  $Cu^{2+}$  treatments showed CAT activity higher than in the control only after 6 days, but CAT activity was markedly inhibited under treatment with  $10^{-3}$  M  $Cu^{2+}$ . At that level, inhibition was more evident in roots than in leaves. CAT activity in both control and tested seedlings increased in leaves over time but decreased in roots.

### EFFECT OF Cu<sup>2+</sup> ON MDA CONCENTRATION

MDA content in the leaves of garlic seedlings grown under different concentrations of  $Cu^{2+}$  was not significantly enhanced versus the control (Fig. 3a). Figure 3b shows that the MDA concentration in roots of plants exposed to  $10^{-3}$  M and  $10^{-5}$  M  $Cu^{2+}$  was not significantly higher than in the control, but in the  $10^{-4}$  M  $Cu^{2+}$  treatment the increase was significant. In 12-day seedlings, MDA content was increased in roots of seedlings growing in the presence of  $10^{-4}$  M  $Cu^{2+}$ . Under all  $Cu^{2+}$  treatments the MDA concentration was higher in roots than in leaves.

### DISCUSSION

The results from this investigation indicate that the growth of garlic seedlings was not significantly inhibited under exposure to  $10^{-5}$  M Cu<sup>2+</sup>, while seedlings exposed to  $10^{-4}$  M and  $10^{-3}$  M Cu<sup>2+</sup> exhibited significant growth reduction. This inhibition was more evident in roots than in leaves. Cu<sup>2+</sup> accumulates mainly in roots; in garlic, Wang et al. (2001) found that small amounts of Cu<sup>2+</sup> translocated to leaves at concentrations of  $10^{-4}$  M and  $10^{-5}$  M Cu<sup>2+</sup>. Data from the present investigation showed that garlic tolerates moderate Cu<sup>2+</sup> levels;  $10^{-3}$  M Cu<sup>2+</sup> exceeded its Cu toxicity thresholds, and the seedlings exposed to that dose did not grow any further during the experiment.

SOD is a crucial component of plants' antioxidative defense systems (Cakmak and Horst, 1991; Scandalios, 1993). In metal stress studies the activity of SOD is greater, as it is engaged in maintenance of the defense system of plants subjected to oxidative stress (Slooten et al., 1995). Three distinct types of SOD have been detected in plants, which can be classified according to their metal cofactors Mn, Fe and Cu/Zn. Mn-SOD is located in the mitochondria and peroxisomes; Fe-SOD, which is not found in all plants, is associated with chloroplasts; and the abundant Cu/Zn SODs are located in the cytosol, chloroplasts and peroxisomes (Bowler et al., 1992; Del Río et al., 1998). Our results showed that  $Cu^{2+}$ dosing (10<sup>-3</sup> M in leaves, and 10<sup>-3</sup> M and 10<sup>-4</sup> M in roots) resulted in a considerable rise of SOD activity. The increase in SOD activity in response to stresses has been attributed to synthesis of the enzyme (Cakmak and Horst, 1991; Slooten et al., 1995).

POD is also an important enzyme, able to scavenge  $H_2O_2$ , which is a major substance degraded by SOD. The role of POD as a stress enzyme in plants has been widely accepted. POD activity has been suggested as a potential biomarker for sublethal metal toxicity in plant species (Agawal and Pandey, 2004). Induction of POD activity has been documented under many stress conditions such as NaCl stress (Agawal and Pandey, 2004), high temperature (El-shintinawy et al., 2004) and toxic concentrations of Cu, Pb, Zn, Cd and Al (Cakmak and Horst, 1991; Radotic et al., 2000; Guo T R et al., 2004). In our experiments we observed enhancement in POD activity due to increasing concentrations of  $Cu^{2+}$ , and also depending on the duration of stress and the organ. When Cu<sup>2+</sup> was assimilated, pernicious peroxide was produced, accumulating with time and level of exposure. Consequently, POD activity was stimulated by the accumulation of peroxide in the plants. Enhancement of POD activity in garlic reflects its great capacity to acclimate to lower  $Cu^{2+}$  stress by rapidly engaging an antioxidative defense system. However, the decline in POD activity in roots after prolonged  $Cu^{2+}$  exposure, especially at  $10^{-3}$  M, indicates that the scavenging function of POD was impaired with prolonged, severe  $Cu^{2+}$  stress. We ascribe the decrease of POD activity to disturbed metabolism caused by excessive  $Cu^{2+}$  in seedlings. That POD activity increased much more in roots than in leaves can be explained by the probability that the glutathione/ascorbate cycle was operating at a high rate in order to detoxify the ROS formed in the roots.

CAT is the most universal oxidoreductase, which scavenges  $H_2O_2$  to  $O_2$  and  $H_2O$ . Our results indicated that the CAT activity response differed between roots and leaves, and that the reaction was dependent on the level and duration of stress. CAT activity declined markedly in roots exposed to  $10^{-3}$  M Cu<sup>2+</sup>. Reduced CAT activity has been regarded as a general response to many stresses, suggested to be due to inhibition of enzyme synthesis or to a change in assembly of enzyme submits (MacRae and Ferguson, 1985). Possibly CAT is a less efficient  $H_2O_2$  scavenger than POD because of its low substrate affinity, and is more sensitive to high Cu<sup>2+</sup> levels than SOD and POD, as seen by the decline in CAT activity.

The level of the antioxidant enzymes SOD, POD and CAT may determine the sensitivity of plants to lipid peroxidation (Kanazawa et al., 2000). A deficiency of this activity may result in the enhancement of free radical-mediated lipid peroxidation. In this study, under moderate dosing with  $10^{-4}$  M and  $10^{-5}$  M Cu<sup>2+</sup>, the activity of SOD, POD and CAT in the seedling changed with the extent of stress, presumably due to the activation of zymogen or to triggering of the defense system by reactive oxygen species. CAT activity decreased at the high level of  $10^{-3}$  M Cu<sup>2+</sup>, indicating that the ability these antioxidant enzymes to eliminate ROS is limited. Higher SOD and POD activity than CAT activity at  $10^{-3}$  M Cu<sup>2+</sup> suggests that SOD and POD provide a better defense mechanism against Cu-induced oxidative damage in garlic seedlings.

MDA is an oxidized product of membrane lipids, and accumulates when plants are exposed to oxidative stresses. MDA concentration is commonly considered a general indicator of lipid peroxidation as well as stress level (Chaoui et al., 1997; Ding et al., 2004). In our study, MDA concentrations in roots exposed to  $10^{-4}$  M and  $10^{-3}$  M Cu<sup>2+</sup> increased versus the control, indicating that Cu<sup>2+</sup> indirectly produced superoxide radicals, resulting in increased lipid peroxidative products and oxidative stress in garlic plants. MDA concentrations did not greatly increase during most of the experimental period under  $10^{-5}$  M Cu<sup>2+</sup> stress.

### **ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

This project was supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of China. We thank the referees for helpful comments. Xuezhi Zhang, Zijun Yang and Xinyu Pang (Department of Biology, Tianjin Normal University, China) assisted in this project.

### REFERENCES

- AGAWAL S, and PANDEY V. 2004. Antioxidant enzyme responses to NaCl stress in *Cassia angustifolia*. *Biologia Plantarum* 48: 555–560.
- ALAOUI-SOSSÉ B, GENET P, VINIT-DUNAND F, TOUSSAINT ML, EPRON D, and BADOT PM. 2004. Effect of copper on growth in cucumber plants (*Cucumis sativus*) and its relationships with carbohydrate accumulation and changes in ion contents. *Plant Science* 166: 1213–1218.
- AUST SD, MOREHOUSE LA, and THOMAS CE. 1985. Role of metals in oxygen radical reactions. *Free radical Biology and Medicine* 1: 3–25.
- BEERS RF, and SIZER IW. 1952. Colorimetric method for estimation of catalase. *Journal of Biological Chemistry* 195: 133–139.
- BOWLER C, VAN MONTAGU M, and INZÉ D. 1992. Superoxide-dismutase and stress tolerance. Annual Review of Plant Physiology and Plant Molecular Biology 43: 83–116.
- BUEGE JA, and AUST SD. 1978. Microsomal lipid peroxidation. Methods in Enzymology. 52: 302–310.
- CAKMAK KB, and HORST WJ. 1991. Effect of aluminum on lipid peroxidation, superoxide dismutase, catalase and peroxidase activities in rot tips of soybean (*Glycine max*). *Physiologia Plantarum* 83: 463–468.
- CHAOUI A, MAZHOUDI S, GHORBAL MH, and FERJANI E. 1997. Cadmium and zinc induction of lipid peroxidation and effects on antioxidant enzyme activities in bean (*Phaseolus vulgaris* L.). *Plant Science* 127: 139–147.

- Dawes IW. 2000. Response of eukaryotic cells to oxidative stress. Agricultural and Biological Chemistry 43: 211–217.
- DEL RIO LA, PASTORI GM, SANDALIO JM, and HERNANDEZ JA. 1998. The activated oxygen role of peroxisomes in senescence. *Plant Physiology* 116: 1195–1200.
- DING HD, WAN YH, QI NM, ZHU WM, YANG XF, and SHAO YC. 2004. Effects of Cd<sup>2+</sup> and Zn<sup>2+</sup> stress on antioxidant enzyme system of tomato seedlings. *Acta Agriculturae Shanghai* 20: 79–82.
- EL-SHINTINAWY F, EBRAHIM MKH, SEWELAM N, and EL-SHOURBAGY MN. 2004. Activity of photosystem 2, lipid peroxidation, and the enzymatic antioxidant protective system in heat shocked barley seedlings. *Photosynthetica* 42: 15–21.
- GUO TR, ZHANG GP, and ZHOU MX. 2004. Effects of aluminum and cadmium toxicity on growth and antioxidant enzyme activities of two barley genotypes with different Al resistance. *Plant and Soil* 258: 241–248.
- HALLIWELL B, and GUTTERIDGE JM. 1984. Oxygen toxicity, oxygen radicals, transition metals and disease. *Biochemical Journal* 219: 1–14.
- KANAZAWA S, SANO S, KOSHIBA T, and USHIMARU T. 2000. Changes in antioxidative in cucumber cotyledons during natural senescence: comparison with those during dark-induced senescence. *Physiologia Plantarum* 109: 211–216.
- LIN CC, and KAO CH. 2000. Effect of NaCl stress on  $\rm H_2O_2$  metabolism in rice leaves. Plant Growth Regulation 30: 151–155.
- LIU DY, WANG YB, ZHANG XX, and SI Q. 2002. Effect of sewage irrigation on wheat growth and its activated oxygen metabolism. *Journal of Applied Ecology* 13: 1319–1322.
- LIU DH, and KOTTKE I. 2004. Subcellular localization of copper in the root cells of *Allium sativum* by electron energy loss spectroscopy (EELS). *Bioresource Technology* 94: 153–158.
- LIU DH, JIANG WS, WANG W, and ZHAI L. 1995. Evaluation of metal ion toxicity on root tip cells by the Allium test. Israel Journal of Plant Sciences 43:125–133.
- LOMBARDI L, and SEBASTIANI L. 2004. Copper toxicity in *Prunus cerasifera*: growth and antioxidant enzymes responses of in vitro grown plants. *Plant Science* 168: 797–802.
- MacRae EA, and FERGUSON IB. 1985. Changes in catalase activity and hydrogen peroxide concentration in plants in response to low temperature. *Physiologia Plantarum* 65: 51–56.
- NOCTOR G, and FOYER CH. 1998. Ascorbate and glutathione: keeping active oxygen under control. Annual Review of Plant Physiology and Plant Molecular Biology 49: 249–279.
- OUZOUNIDOU G, ELEFTHEIOU E, and KARATAGLIS S. 1992. Ecophysiological and ultrastructural effects of copper in *Thlaspi ochroleucum* (Cruciferae). *Canadian Journal of Botany* 70: 947–957.
- OUZOUNIDOU G. 1994. Root growth and pigment composition in relationship to element up take in *Silene compacta* plants treated with copper. *Journal of Plant Nutrition* 17: 933–943.
- PANLA KP, and THOMPSON JE. 1984. Evidence for the accumulation of peroxidized lipids in membranes of senescing cotyledons. *Plant Physiology* 75: 1152–1157.

- RADOTIC K, DUCIC T, and MUTAVDZIC D. 2000. Changes in peroxidase activity and isoenzymes in spruce needles after exposure to different concentrations of cadmium. *Environmental and Experimental Botany* 44: 105–113.
- SCANDALIOS JG. 1993. Oxygen stress and superoxide dismutase. *Plant Physiology* 101: 7–12.
- SCANDALIOS JG, GUAN L, and POLIDOROS A N. 1997. Catalases in plants: gene structure, properties, regulation, and expression. In: Scandalios JG [ed.], Oxidative stress and the molecular biology of antioxidant defenses, 343–406. Cold Spring Harbor Laboratory Press, New York.
- SHAH K, KUMAR RG, VERMA S, and DUBEY RS. 2001. Effect of cadmium on lipid peroxidation, superoxide anion generation and activities of antioxidant enzymes in growing rice seedlings. *Plant Science* 161: 1135–1144.
- SLOOTEN L, CAPIAU K, VAN CAMP W, VAN MONTAGU M, SYBESMA C, and JNZÉ D. 1995. Factors affecting the enhancement of oxidative stress tolerance in transgenic tobacco overexpressing manganese superoxide dismutase in the chloroplasts. *Plant Physiology* 107: 737–750.
- STEPHAN UW, and PROCHAZKA Z. 1989. Physiological disorders of the nicotianamine-auxotroph tomato mutant chloronerva at different levels of iron nutrition. I. Growth characteristics and physiological abnormalities as related to iron and nicotianamine supply. *Acta Botanica Neerlandica* 38: 147–153.
- VAN ASSCHE F, and CLIJSTERS H. 1990. Effects of metal on enzyme activity in Plant. Plant Cell and Environment 13: 195–206.
- WANG D, LI FM, XIONG ZT, and ZHENG ZH. 2000. Relationship between copper's toxicity and phytoaccumulation. *Soil and Environmental Sciences* 9: 146–148.
- WANG W, LIU ZY, JIANG WS, LIU DH, and HOU WQ. 2001. Effects of copper on Allium sativum and accumulation of Cu<sup>2+</sup> by its roots, bulbs and shoots. Acta Botanica Boreali-Occidentalia Sinica 26: 306–312.
- WECKX JEJ, and CLIJSTERS HMM. 1996. Oxidative damage and defense mechanisms in primary leaves of *Phaseolus vulgaris* as a result of root assimilation of toxic amounts of copper. *Physiologia Plantarum* 96: 506–512.
- WISNIEWSKI L, and DICKINSON NM. 2003. Toxicity of copper to *Quercus robur* (English Oak) seedlings from a copperrich soil. *Environmental and Experimental Botany* 50: 99–107.
- YAN CL, HONG YT, FU SZ, FANG ZH, LEI JX, and SHEN Q. 1997. Effect of Cd, Pb stress on the activated oxygen scavenging system in leaves of tobacco. Acta Ecologica Sinica 17: 488–492.
- YANG SY, WANG F, and XIE JC. 2004. Plant toxicity of heavy metals and the tolerant mechanisms of plants. *Journal of Anhui Normal University* (Natural Sciences) 27: 71–74.
- ZHANG LH, LI PJ, LI XM, MENG XL, and XU CB. 2005. Effects of cadmium stress on the growth and physiological characteristics of wheat seedlings. *Chinese Journal Ecology* 24: 458–460.
- ZHAO BS, and BI HW. 1999. Research advances on toxicology of heavy metals in plant cell. *Journal of Zibo University* 1: 86–88.